UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 5

In the Matter of:)	Docket No. FIFRA-05-2016-0005	
A.P. Goldshield, LLC El Paso, Texas,)))	Proceeding to Assess a Civil Penalty Under Section 14(a) of the Federal	
Respondent.)	Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, 7 U.S.C. § 136 <i>l</i> (a)	

Consent Agreement and Final Order

Preliminary Statement

- 1. Complainant, the Director of the Land and Chemicals Division, United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Region 5, brought this administrative action seeking a civil penalty under Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act (FIFRA), 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a).
- 2. On March 1, 2016, EPA filed the Complaint in this action against Respondent A.P. Goldshield, LLC, incorporated in the State of Texas. The Complaint alleged that Respondent distributed or sold a misbranded pesticide, constituting an unlawful act under Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(a)(1)(E); Respondent distributed or sold two pesticide products with claims on its label that substantially differed from claims made for it as part of the statement required in connection with its registration under Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a, constituting unlawful acts under Section 12(a)(1)(B) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(B); Respondent distributed or sold an unregistered pesticide, constituting an unlawful act under Section 12(a)(1)(A) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(a)(1)(A); and Respondent offered for sale via the internet a registered pesticide in violation of a Stop Sale, Use and Removal Order issued under Section 13(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 7 U.S.C. § 136k(a), constituting an unlawful action under Section 12(a)(2)(I) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(I).

3. On March 9, 2016, Respondent provided an Answer and requested a hearing under Section 14 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*, and 40 C.F.R. § 22.15.

Stipulations

- 4. Respondent neither admits nor denies the specific factual allegations and admits the jurisdictional allegations of the Complaint.
- 5. Respondent waives any right to contest the allegations in the Complaint and its right to appeal this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO).
- 6. Respondent certifies to the best of its knowledge that it is in compliance with FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §§ 136-136y.
- 7. Respondent consents to all terms and conditions of this CAFO, including its civil penalty.
- 8. The parties agree that the resolution of this action, without further litigation, and upon the terms of this CAFO, is in the public interest.

Civil Penalty

9. Complainant agrees to reduce the \$27,050 civil penalty proposed in the Complaint to \$21,640. In determining the penalty amount, Complainant considered the appropriateness of the penalty to the size of Respondent's business, the effect on Respondent's ability to continue in business and the gravity of the alleged violation. Complainant also considered EPA's *Enforcement Response Policy for the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act*, dated December 2009.

10. Respondent shall pay the \$21,640 civil penalty (with interest) as set forth in the table below:

	Due by:	Payment	Principal	Interest
Payment 1	w/n 1st 30 days	1,224.03	1,206.00	18.03
Payment 2	60 days of CAFO	1,219.03	1,202.00	17.03
Payment 3	90 days of CAFO	1,218.03	1,202.00	16.03
Payment 4	120 days of CAFO	1,217.03	1,202.00	15.03
Payment 5	150 days of CAFO	1,216.02	1,202.00	14.02
Payment 6	180 days of CAFO	1,215.02	1,202.00	13.02
Payment 7	210 days of CAFO	1,214.02	1,202.00	12.02
Payment 8	240 days of CAFO	1,213.02	1,202.00	11.02
Payment 9	270 days of CAFO	1,212.02	1,202.00	10.02
Payment 10	300 days of CAFO	1,211.02	1,202.00	9.02
Payment 11	330 days of CAFO	1,210.01	1,202.00	8.01
Payment 12	360 days of CAFO	1,209.01	1,202.00	7.01
Payment 13	390 days of CAFO	1,208.01	1,202.00	6.01
Payment 14	420 days of CAFO	1,207.01	1,202.00	5.01
Payment 15	450 days of CAFO	1,206.01	1,202.00	4.01
Payment 16	480 days of CAFO	1,205.01	1,202.00	3.01
Payment 17	510 days of CAFO	1,204.00	1,202.00	2.00
Payment 18	540 days of CAFO	1,203.00	1,202.00	1.00
	TOTALS	\$21,811.29	\$21,640.00	\$171.29

11. Respondent must pay the civil penalty by sending a cashier's or certified check, payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America," to:

U.S. EPA Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

The check must reference the case title ("In the Matter of A.P. Goldshield, LLC"), the installment payment number, and the docket number of this CAFO ("Docket No. FIFRA-05-2016-0005"

12. A transmittal letter stating Respondent's name, complete address, the case title, the

case docket number and the installment payment number must accompany each installment payment. Respondent must send a copy of each transmittal letter accompanying each installment payment (made in accordance with the payment schedule established in paragraph 10), to the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk (E-19J) U.S. EPA, Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, Illinois 60604

Meghan Dunn (LC-8J)
Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Section
U.S. EPA, Region 5
77 West Jackson Boulevard.
Chicago, Illinois 60604

Susan Perdomo (C-14J) Office of Regional Counsel U.S. EPA, Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, Illinois 60604

- 13. This civil penalty is not deductible for federal tax purposes.
- 14. If Respondent does not pay the civil penalty in a timely manner, according to the payment schedule established in paragraph 10, EPA may refer the matter to the Attorney General who will recover such amount by action in the appropriate United States district court under Section 14(a)(5) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a)(5). The validity, amount and appropriateness of the civil penalty are not reviewable in a collection action.
- 15. Pursuant to 31 C.F.R. § 901.9, Respondent must pay the following on any amount overdue under this CAFO. Interest will accrue on any amount overdue from the date payment was due at a rate established by the Secretary of the Treasury. Respondent must pay a \$15 handling charge each month that any portion of the penalty is more than 30 days past due. In addition, Respondent must pay a 6 percent per year penalty on any principal amount 90 days past

due.

General Provisions

- 16. This CAFO resolves only Respondent's liability for federal civil penalties for the violations and facts alleged in the Complaint.
- 17. This CAFO does not affect the rights of EPA or the United States to pursue criminal sanctions or any violations of law which occur after the effective date of this CAFO.
- 18. This CAFO does not affect Respondent's responsibility to comply with FIFRA and other applicable federal, state and local laws.
- 19. This CAFO is a "final order" for purposes of EPA's FIFRA Enforcement Response Policy.
 - 20. The terms of this CAFO bind Respondent, its successors and assigns.
- 21. Each person signing this agreement certifies that he or she has the authority to sign for the party whom he or she represents and to bind that party to its terms.
- 22. Consistent with the Standing Order Authorizing E-Mail Service of Orders and Other Documents Issued by the Regional Administrator or Regional Judicial Officer under the Consolidated Rules, dated March 27, 2015, the parties consent to service of this CAFO by e-mail at the following valid e-mail addresses: perdomo.susan@epa.gov (for Complainant), and tom@goldshield1.com (for Respondent). The parties waive their right to service by the methods specified in 40 C.F.R. § 22.6.
 - 23. Each party agrees to bear its own costs and attorney fees, in this action.
 - 24. This CAFO constitutes the entire agreement between the parties.

In the Matter of: A.P. Goldshield, LLC El Paso, Texas Docket No. FIFRA-05-2016-0005

A.P. Goldshield, LLC

5/19/16	Mum VAS
Date	Thomas Higgins Member, President

United States Environmental Protection Agency, Complainant

Date

Margaret M. Guerriero

Director

Land and Chemicals Division

In the Matter of: A.P. Goldshield, LLC El Paso, Texas Docket No. FIFRA-05-2016-0005

Final Order

This Consent Agreement and Final Order, as agreed to by the parties, shall become effective immediately upon filing with the Regional Hearing Clerk. This Final Order concludes this proceeding pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18 and 22.31. IT IS SO ORDERED.

Date Robert A. Kaplan

Acting Regional Administrator
United States Environmental Protection Agency
Region 5